

**Written review by the official reviewer**  
**of Ibrayev Samat Sabyrovich's dissertation on the topic: «The effectiveness of remote work in the public administration system in the context of digitalization», for the doctor's degree in the profile of the educational program «8D04113 - Public Administration».**

№ п/п	Criteria	Compliance with the criteria (underline one of the options)	Justification of the official reviewer's position (comments should be italicized)
1.	The topic of the dissertation (as of the date of its approval) corresponds to the directions of scientific development and/or state programs.	<p>1.1 Compliance with priority areas of science development or government programs:</p> <p>1) the dissertation was completed within the framework of a project or target program funded from the state budget (specify the name and number of the project or program);</p> <p><b>2) the dissertation was completed within the framework of another state program (specify the name of the program);</b></p> <p>3) the dissertation corresponds to the priority area of science development approved by the Higher Scientific and Technical Commission under the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan (specify the direction).</p>	<p>The dissertation corresponds to the directions of implementation of the following strategic and program documents of the Republic of Kazakhstan:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• State Program «Digital Kazakhstan» (Resolution of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 12, 2017, No. 827)</li> <li>• National Development Plan of the Republic of Kazakhstan until 2025 (Decree of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 26, 2021, No. 521)</li> <li>• «Listening State» Concept (Resolution of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated June 2, 2020, No. 341)</li> <li>• Decree on Debureaucratization (Decree of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated April 13, 2022, No. 872)</li> </ul>
2.	Importance for science	The work <b>makes/does not make</b> a significant contribution to science, and its importance is well <b>disclosed</b> / not disclosed.	<p>The work makes a significant contribution to science, and its importance is well understood.</p> <p><i>This dissertation makes a significant contribution to the field of public administration, and its results and</i></p>

			conclusions represent a new direction in this field of research. The significance of the work is fully disclosed, its relevance, theoretical and practical significance are described in detail.
3.	The principle of independence	The level of independence: 1) <b>high</b> ; 2) average; 3) low; 4) there is no independence.	The original research principle is preserved in this dissertation. The dissertation researcher conducted the research independently, achieving high results with scientific novelty and practical value.
4.	The principle of internal unity	4.1 Substantiation of the relevance of the dissertation: 1) <b>justified</b> ; 2) partially justified; 3) is not justified.	The author determined the relevance of the research topic by the need to optimize business processes in public administration with the maximum involvement of civil servants in the use of digital tools, the relevance of the dissertation is convincingly emphasized.
		4.2 The content of the dissertation reflects the topic of the dissertation: 1) <b>reflects</b> ; 2) partially reflects; 3) does not reflect.	The structure of the dissertation fully corresponds to the stated research topic. The introduction substantiates the relevance of the work, defines the purpose, objectives, object and subject of the study, reveals scientific novelty, theoretical and practical significance, methodological approaches and source base. The first chapter examines the theoretical and methodological foundations of remote employment in the public administration system in the context of digitalization, including an analysis of the concepts of «New Public Management» and «Good Governance», as well as foreign experience. The second chapter analyzes the effectiveness of remote work in government agencies of the Republic of Kazakhstan, including the impact of digitalization, environmental aspects and the organization of remote workplace. The third chapter is devoted to assessing the potential for the introduction of remote employment, including sociological research, analysis of functional



			responsibilities and calculation of opportunities for testing new work formats. In conclusion, the results of the study are summarized and practical recommendations are formulated, as well as appendices with materials confirming the results of the work are presented.
		4.3. The purpose and objectives correspond to the topic of the dissertation: 1) <b>correspond to;</b> 2) partially correspond to; 3) they don't match.	The purpose and objectives of the thesis correspond to the research topic and are consistent with the logical structure of the study.
		4.4 All sections and provisions of the dissertation are logically interrelated: 1) <b>completely interconnected;</b> 2) the relationship is partial; 3) there is no relationship.	The content of the thesis has a logically structured structure and internal unity. Each chapter of the thesis is a logical continuation of the previous one and is closely interrelated with subsequent chapters.
		4.5 The new solutions (principles, methods) proposed by the author are reasoned and evaluated in comparison with the known solutions: 1) <b>there is a critical analysis;</b> 2) partial analysis; 3) the analysis is not your own opinions, but quotes from other authors.; 4) there is no analysis.	The researcher drew certain conclusions for each section of the dissertation. The new solutions proposed by the author have been tested and evaluated in comparison with previously known solutions on the research topic.
5.	The principle of scientific novelty	5.1 Are the scientific results and provisions new? 1) completely new; 2) <b>partially new (25-75% are new);</b> 3) not new (less than 25% are new).	The results obtained during the dissertation research have elements of scientific novelty. It has been established that the effectiveness of government agencies in the context of digitalization is largely determined by the degree of development of information and communication technologies and their competent application in the organization of remote work. The author offers specific

			recommendations for improving remote employment mechanisms in the public administration system, as well as for ensuring digital security and sustainability of administrative processes in the Republic of Kazakhstan.
		5.2 Are the conclusions of the dissertation new? 1) completely new; 2) <b>partially new (25-75% are new);</b> 3) not new (less than 25% are new).	The conclusions of the dissertation are partly new, as they are based on an analysis of the works of foreign and domestic authors, recommendations of international experts. The conclusions are formulated competently, concisely, logically follow from the content of the dissertation and reveal the completeness of the research work.
		5.3 Technical, technological, economic or managerial decisions are new and justified: 1) completely new; 2) partially new (25-75% are new); 3) not new (less than 25% are new).	Since the dissertation is carried out in the humanities, technical, technological, economic or managerial decisions are not considered as the purpose of the research.
6.	Validity of the main conclusions	All the main conclusions are based/not based on scientifically significant evidence or are well-founded enough (for qualitative research and areas of study in the arts and humanities).	All the conclusions of the study are based on extensive scientific data. The results and principles of the research work differ in accordance with the content of the research and the effectiveness of the methods and approaches used in the research.
7.	The main provisions submitted for defense	It is necessary to answer the following questions for each provision separately: 7.1 Has the position been proven? 1) <b>has it been proven;</b> 2) rather proven; 3) rather not proven; 4) not proven; 5) in the current formulation, it is impossible to verify the validity of the provision. 7.2 Is it trivial?	Conclusion 1. The author's definition of remote employment in the public administration system is proved and proposed as a socio-organizational phenomenon with a complex nature, which can be formed spontaneously or purposefully, reflecting current trends in digitalization and transformation of the formats of civil servants' work. This definition is supported by theoretical analysis and empirical evidence confirming



		<p>1) yes;  2) <b>no</b>;  3) in the current formulation, it is impossible to verify the triviality of the position.</p> <p>7.3 Is it new?  1) <b>yes</b>;  2) no;  3) in the current formulation, it is impossible to verify the novelty of the provision.</p> <p>7.4 Application level:  1) narrow;  2) average;  3) <b>wide</b>;  4) in the current wording, it is impossible to verify the level of application of the provision.</p> <p>7.5 Is it proved in the article?  1) <b>yes</b>;  2) no;  3) in the current formulation, it is impossible to verify the evidence of the provision in the article.</p>	<p>the impact of distance employment on the effectiveness of government agencies and interaction with society.</p> <p>Conclusion 2.</p> <p>It is shown that the effectiveness of the introduction of remote work in government agencies of the Republic of Kazakhstan depends on the adaptation of digital and management technologies to the specific conditions of the public sector. The development of information and communication technologies is recognized as a key factor in improving the quality of government interaction with the public. This conclusion is based on an analysis of modern practices and sociological research.</p> <p>Conclusion 3.</p> <p>An applied model for assessing the readiness and effectiveness of remote work based on sociological data and analysis of functional responsibilities has been developed and tested. The use of modern methods of digital analysis and forecasting makes it possible to increase the accuracy of estimates and optimize the processes of introducing remote forms of employment. The novelty and practical significance of the model are confirmed by the results of the study.</p> <p>Conclusion 4.</p> <p>Specific recommendations are proposed for the organization of remote work in government agencies, as well as for ensuring information security and protecting digital privacy. These recommendations are widely applied and aimed at improving the sustainability and efficiency of public administration in the context of digitalization. All proposals are proved and justified in the published</p>
--	--	--	---

			scientific articles of the author and in the main part of the dissertation.
8.	The principle of reliability. Reliability of sources and information provided	8.1 Choice of methodology - is it justified or is the methodology described in sufficient detail: 1) yes; 2) no.	The methodological approach in the study is justified and described in detail. The work uses a comprehensive methodological toolkit that includes an optimal combination of quantitative and qualitative methods, as well as general scientific approaches, which provides a comprehensive and in-depth study of the problems of remote employment in the public administration system.
		8.2 The results of the dissertation were obtained using modern methods of scientific research and methods of processing and interpreting data using computer technologies: 1) yes; 2) no.	The results of the dissertation work were obtained using modern scientific research methods and data processing and interpretation technologies. The results of the research work were obtained using quantitative and qualitative methods of scientific research.
		8.3 Theoretical conclusions, models, identified relationships and patterns are proven and confirmed by experimental research (for areas of training in pedagogical sciences, the results are proven on the basis of a pedagogical experiment): 1) yes; 2) no.	The theoretical conclusions, identified relationships and patterns in the thesis are substantiated and confirmed.
		8.4 Important statements are confirmed/partially confirmed/not confirmed by references to relevant and reliable scientific literature.	The important points of the dissertation are supported by references to accurate and reliable domestic and foreign scientific literature.
		8.5 The literature sources used are sufficient/not sufficient for a literary review.	The sources used are sufficient for a literature review.
9	The principle of practical value	9.1 The dissertation has theoretical significance: 1) yes;	Scientific research is of great theoretical importance. The work carried out on the formulation of a scientific and



		2) no.	theoretical problem and its solution is characterized by innovation.
		9.2 The dissertation has practical significance and there is a high probability of applying the obtained results in practice: 1) yes; 2) no.	The thesis has significant practical value, and the results obtained have a high potential for implementation in real practice, the conclusions drawn can be effectively used in the formation and implementation of policies for the development of the public administration system, taking into account the need for its digital transformation and increased efficiency.
		9.3 Suggestions for practice are new: 1) completely new; 2) partially new (25-75% are new); 3) not new (less than 25% are new).	The practical suggestions are new. In addition, in his dissertation, the author identifies a number of issues as research topics that will serve as the basis for scientific work by other researchers in the future.
10.	Quality of writing and design	The quality of academic writing: 1) high; 2) average; 3) below average; 4) low.	The academic quality of the research work is at a sufficiently good level. The language of presentation is clear, and modern terminology of political science is used correctly.
11.	Notes to the dissertation	Analyzing the presented work, it should be noted that the practical implementation of the remote employment format is associated with the need to ensure proper control by the employer, as well as to assess the effectiveness of professional comments on the dissertation activities of employees. In his work, the author examines this aspect through the prism of the use of information systems that ensure accounting and control of the performance of official duties of civil servants. At the same time, it seems advisable to expand the range of proposed tools for evaluating employee performance through more effective and systematic mechanisms for monitoring the implementation of goals and the fulfillment of tasks assigned to government employees working remotely. In addition, among the management measures proposed by the author for the introduction of remote forms of employment in the public sector, special attention should be paid to the need for additional financial costs associated with monthly compensation payments. This aspect is justified by the provisions of paragraph 4 of Article 138 of the Labor Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan, according to which the employer is obliged to provide the employee with everything necessary for the performance of work duties, including equipment, informatization facilities, communication services and other means related to their installation and maintenance.	

	doctoral student's articles on the research topic (in the case of a dissertation defense in the form of a series of articles, official reviewers comment on the scientific level of each doctoral student's article on the research topic)	
13.	The decision of the official reviewer (according to paragraph 28 of this Model Provision)	to award a doctorate degree in the profile of the educational program «8D04113 - Public Administration»

Based on the above, I believe that Ibrayev Samat Sabyrovich's dissertation on the topic «The effectiveness of remote work in the public administration system in the context of digitalization» meets the requirements of the Degree Awarding Rules and the applicant deserves to be awarded a doctorate degree in the profile of the educational program «8D04113 - Public Administration»

**The official reviewer,**

Director of Strategy and HR Department

Maqsut Narikbayev University.

Doctor in the profile, teaching professor



*A. Kussainova*

**A. Kussainova**

